

November 19, 2014

# **MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE COLLIER COUNTY PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY BOARD**

Naples, Florida, November 19, 2014

LET IT BE REMEMBERED, that the Collier County Parks and Recreation Advisory Board, in and for the County of Collier, having conducted business herein, met on this date at 2:00 P.M. in a REGULAR SESSION at North Collier Regional Park, Administration Building, Conference Room A, 15000 Livingston Road, Naples, Florida, with the following members present:

CHAIRMAN:	Edward "Ski" Olesky
VICE CHAIR:	Phil Brougham
	Mary Bills
	John Fuchs
	McMurdo Smith
	David Saletko (Absent)
	Rebecca Gibson-Lamel

ALSO PRESENT: Barry Williams, Director  
Jeanine McPherson Hogle, Assistant Director PAR  
Amanda Townsend, Director - Operations Support  
Nancy Olson, Regional Manager I  
Rick Garby, Maintenance Supervisor  
Hank Jones, Facilities Management  
Sue Zimmerman, Real Property Management



- I. **Call to Order**  
**Chairman Olesky** called the meeting to order at 2:00 P.M.  
*A quorum was established. Six (6) voting members were present.*
- II. **Pledge of Allegiance and Invocation**  
The Pledge of Allegiance was recited and Invocation was held.
- III. **Approval of Agenda**  
*Add: VII. Marsha Cravens after Parking Fees*  
  
*Vice Chair Brougham moved to approve Agenda as amended.*  
*Second by Mr. Fuchs.*  
*Motion carried unanimously; 6 – 0.*
- IV. **Approval of October 15, 2014 Minutes**  
*Strike: VIII. John Fuchs left at 2:55 PM*  
*Change: VIII. Parking at Wiggins Pass to Parking at Connor Park*  
  
*Ms. Bills moved to approve the October 15, 2014 Minutes as amended.*  
*Second by Mr. Fuchs.*  
*Motion carried unanimously; 6 – 0.*
- V. **Staff Highlights**  
**Capital Project Review**  
**Barry Williams** provided a Capital Projects Update dated October 16, 2014.  
(See attached) He reported all items highlighted in yellow have been completed and will be removed when list is updated.
  - Eagle Lakes Community Center estimated time for completion in February. A Park Program Supervisor, Mr. Matt Lee, has been hired to coordinate that project with Facilities Management in selecting items for that Community Center. A grand opening date has not been selected at this time.**Ms. Bills** inquired about an article in the Collier Newspaper regarding Commissioner Fiala and the progress of the Community Center.  
**Hank Jones** responded there were some quality issues with the contractor that caused a three (3) week delay. Some important details were not followed under the contract. The Contractor was made to remove a third of the roof already installed and some gutters; and then reinstall them properly. The Contractor also did not follow installment specifications to prevent windows from future leaks. The Contractor was made to remove the windows and do them correctly.  
**Ms. Gibson-Lamel** asked if an interested pickle ball enthusiast meeting had been held.  
**Barry Williams** responded Jeanine McPherson-Hogle met with some of the pickle ball enthusiast early on. Considering developing internally.  
A question was asked if East Naples expanding to pickle ball.  
No plans for PAR to add lines to courts that don't have the lines already.  
Additional capital project questions were addressed by Staff.



**VI. New Business**

**Big Corkscrew Island Regional Park**

Staff distributed Big Corkscrew Island Regional Park Meeting minutes from Public Information Meetings held on September 30 and October 30, 2014. BCIRP Vote Results and the BCIRP and Flyer information on BCIRP website. (See attached)

**Amanda Townsend** gave a slide presentation on government facilities and a brief history on the BCIRP. BCIRP Master Plan was designed in 2006 and due to the economic decline was not started. On September 30 and October 30 a design and information public meetings were held. The most important elements that were incorporated in to 2006 design plan:

- Community Center - ranked #1 without any negative votes.
- Interactive Water Feature
- Walking and Jog Path
- Soccer Fields

New elements suggested and were not in the 2006 Plan included:

- Little league complex
- Gymnasium
- Pool and Aquatic complex - seems to be bubbling up to the top, as something that is important to the community.

The County is hosting an on-line conversation and interactive website, where folks can go register, post ideas and go up and down on other folk's ideas to have conversation with the public on what they want at BCIRP.

She reported several community groups have been holding there own meetings; Golden Gate Civic Association, Homeowners Association of Golden Gate Estates, Waterways Community and possibly Corkscrew Island and Orange Tree Association have all been working together. The County is getting dribbles of feedback from them.

She explained the proposed phasing and funding plan. The plan is to possibly break ground in September/October 2015 to begin to deliver Phase I.

Phase II could include a Community Center, as well as an aquatic complex by 2019.

---

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Can I ask you a question?

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Mm hmmm.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: I'm sure there is an Engineering or funding reason.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Mm hrm.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: but the Community Center, ranked far away, number (1) one and the four (4) soccer fields are 4<sup>th</sup> and 5<sup>th</sup>, why aren't they switched, why don't you put the Community Center in Phase I?

AMANDA TOWNSEND: It is a possibility and we've discussed it. At this time, generally speaking, you've got to get that infrastructure



and horizontal construction in first, so that, it is sort of an industry standard for the way that parks and ...

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: I know, I'm in site work and utilities.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: (Laugh)

VICE CHAIRMAN BROUGHAM: Then we move down to four (4) soccer fields for \$3,000,000.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Let me respond to that, if I could, because I've had some input into that decision. I think, you know, there is a couple of things that are coming out of this and there are so many moving parts to this thing but the one is, in kinda of like what we've done at Eagle Lakes where we... and what we've done at Golden Gate and Immokalee Sports Complex, were you have a community center pool combo. If we had those components in the initial phase. The other consideration there, is staffing and operational costs. So...

VICE CHAIRMAN BROUGHAM: Mm Hmm

BARRY WILLIAMS: you know, the thought of trying to get in and get as much as you can, in terms of a park for the public to use as quickly as they can. It just seemed that in that initial phase, where those components...

VICE CHAIRMAN BROUGHAM: (inaudible)

AMANDA TOWNSEND: and of course, staffing and operational costs come into consideration, as well as, the complication of trying to complete infrastructural construction once you got people in the parking

\_\_\_\_\_  
VICE CHAIRMAN BROUGHAM: (inaudible)

MCMURDO SMITH: I have a question Amanda, down there, where you have the Community Center at 7,000 sq. ft.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Mm Hmm.

MCMURDO SMITH: I think it is a little small for that area. Most of the other ones that we've been building lately, have been what... about? About 10,000 plus. In that area, out there, where is a lot of population and growth, I think you should either make it a little bigger with a possibility of expansion versus 7,000, because a 7,000 sq. ft. building is not very big. This is just my... this is my comment.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: No, I absolutely here you. We have seen, for example, at \_\_\_\_\_ Community Park that was started at 7,000 and had an expansion in several places. The plan would definitely be to leave room for expansion. We heard loud and clear... In fact, the 2006 plan had a 5,000 sq. ft. community center. We heard loud and clear from the community that they did not think that was sufficient. Of course, to build the bigger community center, all at once, delays... you know... delays your funding.

MCMURDO SMITH: It is, but there again, it is their number one priority.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Okay.

MCMURDO SMITH: Okay. Going to the aquatic complex. I know at the meeting there was a big outcry for the aquatic complex and also there was an outcry from the Athletic Director and Diving Coach at the high school \_\_\_\_\_. I just want to say there was a difference between a competitive pool





and a recreation pool. If we are going to build a pool for the high school swim team, I think we have to combine a recreation and a competitive pool. And then... why isn't the school building a competition pool for the high school team? They built a football fields and a baseball fields. So, then we can build a recreation pool that we could...you know... like Sun N Fun where there is less water depth and all that, because when you get in to competition the water has to be higher and you don't get as much family type of activity. That is my only concern there.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: We have... before we go to speak the Board on December 9<sup>th</sup>... umm, if at all possible we'll be having some conversation with the School District because we want to identify usual needs and have those kind of conversations with them. We haven't done that yet... umm, but it is on our radar in the very near future.

MCMURDO SMITH: A comment made was... We have to drive our swim team all the way to Immokalee to swim. Well, the school is right there.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: And the school is incurring operational cost for that.

MCMURDO SMITH: I think the school should build it.

(Laughter)

*(Background remarks made by others - inaudible)*

BARRY WILLIAMS: We can take those comments into the discussions with the School Board.

(Laughter)

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Absolutely.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: If you'll build it, we'll use it.

(Laughter)

AMANDA TOWNSEND: So when we start to look further out in the planning window, things get fuzzier. An initiative, that has been running parallel to our conversations with the community about the Big Corkscrew Island Regional Park... umm, is an initiative that we got direction by the County Board about, about a year ago... and that is to attempt to look for an appropriate location for a soccer complex in a private/public partnership to be built by the Southwest Florida Soccer Foundation \_\_\_\_\_ Naples Adrenaline. Ummm, right now, we think that there may be some possibilities to develop that partnership in a third phase of this Park that was certainly not anticipated when the 2006 plan was done and... and really has only been on staff radar screen since this spring. The reason for that is that the ... let's go back to this slide here... the Public Utilities Division commissioned an Optimization Study to look at ROW planning and infrastructure planning and what have you ... in this entire Northeast area. And one of interesting things that came out of this study with that Consultant did is ... was that this 90 acre lake here, which in 2006 was anticipated to be a recreational lake... is... it is probably of poor quality and very low... has very shallow depth and some maintenance challenges and may/could be used better, as water management and with some fill, creating some more park acreage, rather than being used as a full 90 acre recreational lake. And here is what that looked like when it came out of that Optimization Study that was commissioned by Public Utilities. That would be the lake and the concept would be to dig



deeper where there is water and accumulate fill for more acreage for park facilities within that footprint. Here again, this is still kind of in a feasibility stage but we think there is a potential there that it would work and a potential that would be a place to locate the soccer complex.

MCMURDO SMITH: At the meeting, the people who were there; were completely, almost 100% against that accept if there a pool was involved. So, are you still going back with this same plan... going back to the Board?

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Well, so far, the kind of input we've gotten... we absolutely know that the community members in... in particularly in the immediate area but also in surrounding areas are not at all interested in a soccer complex initiative, particularly in the upper 59 acres. We surveyed by hand at the meeting about... "Well, what about in the third phase, in the lake area?" And we got about 15 no's and 5 maybe's... umm... on-line I'm are getting the same kind of feedback. Just recent... just as recently as this morning, the Civic Association and the Homeowners Association, have both reached out and said "we want to make sure we have fully contemplated this concept; can you forward us more information?" So, nobody has taken this completely off the table yet.

MCMURDO SMITH: Sure sounded like it is.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Can you go back to slide 3? To that overall grinder... wherever, wherever that was. Umm. No. No. Nope.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: This one. No. (Moves slides)

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Nope. There. What is that up at the top? That race track...

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Parking lot.

MURCO SMITH: Parking lot.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: A parking lot.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Yes.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: And then go to the slide that shows the Sheriff's Substation, \_\_\_\_\_, and so forth. Okay. And... right in the middle... how... Point to where the potential soccer facility would be.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: This is that 90 acres.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Right there. Okay. What is the distance between the soccer complex and that housing development to the left?

AMANDA TOWNSEND: I couldn't tell you off... I couldn't...

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: A thousand yards.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Feet.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: A thousand feet. Well, I wasn't at that meeting... but I can tell you what my opinion would be... that due to the traffic and the all the activity that would be at the soccer complex, day or night or both... if I lived there, I wouldn't want any part of it either.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: That's understood. Of course, it is a Regional Park so it has a draw \_\_\_\_\_.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Yeah, I know but umm.



AMANDA TOWNSEND: Something else I should add... is that there will be a ROW alignment that should come in right about here. So, there will be vehicular access to the park from the Southeast, as well as the Northwest.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Having a soccer complex at North Collier Park... is one thing, you look around and you don't see any homes around here.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Well, (inaudible)

MARY BILLS: Shortly will.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Well, this was here before the homes were built. Just an observation.

MCMURDO SMITH: I also think the public out there was against the private sector building that facility. I don't think they would be opposed to having more soccer fields in the lower area, down there, \_\_\_\_\_ as long as it is under control by the County control and not a private \_\_\_\_\_. That was kind of the feeling I got.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Yeah, and that will take more conversations with the community. Obviously, to have a public/private partnership is a significant savings to the County... umm, both for construction costs and operational costs. At this point we are encouraging Southwest Soccer Foundation to reach out to the Community and find out what the concerns are. And see if they can be addressed or not. Maybe they can and maybe they can't and of course, ultimately, it would be truly a Boards decision, as well.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Aren't they... the Soccer Foundation... aren't they also looking at all available potential sites in this area or are they sort of, pointing their gun right there.

AMANDA TOWNSEND: No, no, in fact, we met with Mr. Budzke this morning and he is remains open to other locations, as well.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: You know, Madam Recorder, some of these comments that happened, like the past 10 minutes and so forth, if those could more towards the verbatim side than a top level summary, I think it's important for the Board Members comments to get in the minutes. The minutes, are a lot of times read by the Commissioners and others and I think input from PARAB Members is important for them to see.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Do we have any public speakers?

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Nope.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: You're not done yet?

AMANDA TOWNSEND: I think I am done. I think I am done.

BARRY WILLIAMS: I don't know that we were looking, Mr. Chair, for anything other than informational at this point. I think that we did want to bring this... a summary of ... kind of... the results of the community meetings... There is a desire to for us to go to the Board of County Commissioners..., and do likewise and get some direction from them. I do appreciate comments, they will certainly be noted and brought forward, but that if you do have public comments... certainly.



VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Just to add on to that, though, and we have discussed this at the last meeting to some extent. To clarify in the process the role of the Parks and Recreational Advisory Board in these processing. I think the public meetings are absolutely essential for a step... and as plans, we can all get more specific and get a combination of plans, potential plans, public input and as so forth. To vent it through this Board is absolutely a good thing to do, as part of process going forward... not in the rebound... and that's my comment to incorporate our comments going forward,, and that is my opinion, not the Board's opinion but I think we heard last time, this Board wants to play a more active role, in the process, in a timely fashion rather than a retroactive.

BARRY WILLIAMS: I appreciate that and we'll certainly endeavor to do that. I do want to say... I do want to thank Mr. Smith for being at the public meeting. That was very helpful to have that insight. So, I appreciate that.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Now public comments.

CORRINE PULIZZOTTO: Hi, my name is Corrine. I am a Waterway's resident. I've been at the meetings about this, and we were definitely fine about a recreation park, long overdue out there. The problem is... the privately owned homes situation, we've worked with the fairgrounds, we tried (inaudible), and also tried being good neighbors. Now, you're having a privately owned... that's a problem we have. There is nothing out there. There are no restaurants, no hotels, no anything. (Inaudible) I just want to let you know... we are very concern about it. There are four communities surrounding this park. Not access can happen when the fairground roads (inaudible) ... We have phase parking when that happens. We have porta potties set-up on the road when the fairgrounds come out, cause there's nothing out there. This is a problem and we are very, very concern about this. There is miles before you can get into this because of the four surrounding communities. That's all. I just wanted to share that. Thank you.

SHIRLEY COTHRAN: My name is Shirley Cothran. I am from Waterways also. I am going to look at this a little bit differently... and there has been a lot of talk about this park for the community and the things that should go into it to serve the community. But I asked at one of the public meetings and I think I might have irritated some people... as to why County Staff was spending time doing site search for a private company... and the reply they made... made me start to think that these people do work for the County Commissioners and that's why they were doing it. Then I also look at an RFP that the County did. We're talking about giving this man, 60 acres. The value of the land out there is \$30,000 per acre. We are talking about giving him, 1.8 million dollars' worth of land. He said he'll would put some of his own money into it. But quite frankly, I have never heard of this man before this thing came up... I'm not sure many people have. In the RFP, that I looked at... it asked for the company's qualifications to do a project... it asks for their employee's experience... it asks for other projects and if they met the deadlines, did they come in on budget... they asked for asked for \_\_\_\_\_ canals and a mitigation study. I don't know if you have gotten all those things from this man or not, but I think those things should be done before the County commits money... commits land to him, because that's





what you do. I just don't know... and you can tell me whether or not... the due diligence has been done or not concerning this project. I watched a Board of Commissioners meeting, from last December... and those people were all excited and that is great to have enthusiasm but they weren't asking any business questions... and you know, I thought its part of the job. That's my other (inaudible) that have come out in other meetings, there has been some emotional meetings. So we do have real concerns. We do ...we get hit with... my house gets hit with light solutions from the schools ball field because I'm right behind it. It hits a friend of mine's house. It doesn't bother me because I'm in the back of my house. The houses in Waterways, there is a number of them. I know because I sent them emails last night. ... It is their backyards that will be looking at this park. I won't bore you today... maybe I will email, if I have the email addresses... of pictures, those people have taken out of the back of their house and what they see looking at from their back of their homes. No one has mentioned a thing about privacy walls or sound barriers or any of this. I don't know if they are in the plans or not but I didn't see them. So...

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: They're a bunch of years away from that detail. Right now it is just concepts. I mean bare bones concept, all you see is what is on the slide. You got years, believe me.

SHIRLEY COTHRAN: The other thing... (Inaudible) where did they place the stadium? ... On the west end of land there, at the lake, it is closer to Waterways than to the high school, or the orchards or the water treatment plant. So...

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Email your concerns and pictures into the County Commissioners as well as here. Those people are going to make the decision.

SHIRLEY COTHRAN: And we are doing that. But we...

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Sometimes we like the decisions here, but we're not allowed. All we can make are recommendations.

SHIRLEY COTHRAN: That is what we would like, your comments to help us.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Going to Old Business.

MURDO SMITH: Can I ask a question before we go on to Old Business?

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Yes.

MURDO SMITH: Barry, there's a question that I think you brought up also... about the possibility of filling in that lake and using it for more recreational facilities... has there been any look into what this might cost or anything or?

BARRY WILLIAMS: Public Utilities did an Optimization Study and suggested we could fill it in and create another 45 acres.

MURDO SMITH: Okay. Did they say how much be to fill that in at some point?

BARRY WILLIAMS: We've had some rough estimates. There is a variety of scenarios you can pursue. That the ... I am not even sure I got a good range, but it would be... at \$30,000 an acre, you know... to go buy land, it would be worth our while to do it and to develop it and to create that there.

MURDO SMITH: I think maybe, if that's a feasibility...



instead of putting a soccer complex in, maybe look at filling that in and putting other County recreation facilities in those 45 acres that would be what the public would need, maybe a little league complex, Everyone is looking for... where the lights could be well maintained... or something like that. I think we should continue to look at that, it is very valuable, to have those extra 45 acres.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Absolutely. And I do think that is the intent... that's to get to the Board and say we've had these public meetings and this is the kind of feedback we are getting. Certainly we are hearing people's opposition to Mr. Budzke's proposal. And at this is the point, I think, from the Staff point of view, keep your options open... let's look at it. There is an initiative in Lee County that was just talked about, similar kind of deal, a private/public partnership where they developed basketball/volleyball space for... from... rerun from a private sector. I think our question is... and the questions is... What can Mr. Budzke provide that will benefit the public? I think he is working hard to try to define that. Whether it is a good idea or not, whether it should be here or not... I think, ultimately we are going to go to the Board and get them to give us some direction so.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Is there some other property that was for sale were the groves were? At one time... I thought...

BARRY WILLIAMS: I think that went under... Mr. Paul sold those lands to a private developer. So thank you for letting us bring this to you and we will do this more than what perhaps, we have done in the past.

MURDO SMITH: When does it go before the Board again?

BARRY WILLIAMS: December 9<sup>th</sup>

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: In the same sense in what you've presented, Amanda?

AMANDA TOWNSEND: A little more refined.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: More power point?

BARRY WILLIAMS: She cleans up a little better before.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Any other comments?

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Well, I think you should say... that you had a review session with the PARAB and there were public comments. Otherwise

AMANDA TOWNSEND: Yes.

---

## VII. Old Business

### PARAB Member's Terms

Barry Williams provided a copy of an email sent to PABAB Members on October 27, 2014. (See attached) He reviewed:

- Advisory Board Member terms are for four (4) years.
- The new Advisory Board Member, Ms. Rebecca Lamel, was approved by the Board yesterday.
- Board Members with terms due to expire on December 31, 2014, applications were approved at the November Board of County Commissioner's meeting.



**Pelican Bay Community Park**

Staff distributed copies of a *Special Warranty Deed and Declaration of Restrictions and Protective Covenants for Parcel "A", Pelican Bay Unit Nineteen*; both dated September 26, 1994. Also distributed: Executive Summary: *Recommendation to approve the expenditure of Tourist Development Beach Park Facilities Tax Funds for \$734,370 with Q. Grady Minor and Associates, P.A. for Request For Proposal number 14-6301, "Design Services for Clam Pass", and make a finding that this expenditure promotes tourism.* (See attached)

**Barry Williams** reported:

- Any improvements made to Pelican Bay Community Park requires the approval of the Pelican Bay Foundation.
- He is not opposed to reinstalling a baseball field at Pelican Bay. He noted the previous field had received very little use.

Discussion was made on lights, maintenance and the reinstallation of the baseball field to be used for little league baseball.

**Adopt a Park Follow up List**

Staff provided a "Park Follow-Up List." (See attached) Due to a shortage of Staff, the list is not as comprehensive as he prefers. He will expand on it. He will provide the list on a regular basis.

**Rebecca Gibson-Lamel** asked if she would be assigned any parks to report on.

**Barry Williams** responded yes and this is something we'll have to talk about.

---

**Clam Pass Boardwalk Project**

BARRY WILLIAMS: Just for the audience. There are a couple of things we wanted to do with this item. One is, we do have an Agenda Item that we have in your packet... that we are asking for your approval on. But rather than to do that... then... two items later let Marsha talk... I think we might need to reconsider that. What I wanted to do initially, was just to tell you where we were with this project, I think that was the question that had emerged last month, to what extent we kept you all in the dark, our apologies, that was not in our intent. I put a couple of things in your packet to kinda let you know the progression of this thing. I actually approached the Pelican Bay Foundation last... I want to say last winter and talked to them about a project that has been on the books for some time. That's to redo the Clam Pass Park parking lot, install a kayak launch and to extend a southern boardwalk from the existing boardwalk. And when I went to the Pelican Bay Foundation and talked to them about that... they had a lot of questions about that project. Primarily, its impact on the current mangroves that are there, permitting requirements, the big question was the need that we had for that project. All those kind of questions. Throughout that conversation with the Pelican Bay Foundation, I was actually asked by Marsha to talk to Pelican Bay Services Division. Which I did, and talked to them about just kind of our plans our thoughts. I was also invited to attend a Mangrove Action Group, as well, to talk to them. And so we are starting to get interest certainly in this project, as far as; what we are doing with it, why we are doing it and how we're going to do it.



The initial stages of this... the money has been appropriated in this project, at least since 2007. The concept is simple with the southern boardwalk is to extend it down the property line, that we own in Clam Pass. It is a public park... that what we see is that people will go out to the park and at a certain point they will either go north or south or stop. So the concept is to try to spread people down the beach and get them down to the beach.

What we've done at this point is... were asking for funding. The money has been appropriated, it's in the budget. But whenever we take a step to spend money, we go to the Tourist Development Council (TDC.) We go to the Board of County Commissioners. We haven't traditionally gone to you for this, because it is not an area where you are appropriating money or okaying funds. But given the interest and the need for us to be as transparent as could, we wanted to bring this to you and let you hear from people who may be affected by it and then ask for your ups or downs on bringing this forward. What I would tell you too... since this is a project that is already approved by the Board of County Commissioners/TDC. If you vote down, I still feel an obligation to bring it forward and tell them that's where you guys are. If you vote up, I would also let them know that as well. That is kind of the history of the project... where we are... where we are today. Hank Jones is here.

In your packet is an Executive Summary that would go to the TDC that would go to the Board of County Commissions. (See attached) I will read for everyone's sake.... Recommendation is to approve the expenditure Tourist Development Beach Park Facilities Tax Funds for \$734,370 with Q. Grady Minor and Associates P.A. for Request for Proposal (RFP) Number 14-6301 for Design Services for Clam Pass Park Boardwalk and Restroom Facility and make a finding that this expenditure promotes tourism.

The last thing I'll say about this is... if this is approved, we would work with a Consultant. The expectation from of the Pelican Bay Foundation, we did meet their... with a Sub Committee at their behest, to look at the plans we had... at conceptual drawings we had... and they asked us to take away several things and to improve several things, which we intend to do. If we hire a design Consultant, that is what we would ask the Consultant to do, to make that conceptual drawing according to the feedback that we've gotten from the Pelican Bay Foundation and ultimately we would bring that Conceptual Drawing back to Pelican Bay Foundation for their initial approval. There are three (3) levels of approval that we have to achieve with the Pelican Bay Foundation... and this would be the first step. So there is a lot of opportunity for public input and it is something that the... Hank Jones wants to say something.

HANK JONES: I want to... I got a question... just because I get stuck with doing what everybody says. (Laughter) We had a lot of talk earlier in this meeting on what the public needs and public wants. I'm confused on this Clam Pass thing on the interplay between what the public wants and what Pelican Bay Foundation wants. I don't how that should be addressed. But I think we should give this project the same benefit of public... public input as the input from the Pelican Bay Foundation. But I am not aware of the





agreements out there. I'm just talking as a citizen, representing whatever the public might want at this facility that perhaps some other interest don't want.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Good.

HANK JONES: Well, that fell flat, didn't it? (Laughter)

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Nice comment (inaudible)

BARRY WILLIAMS: Mr. Chair... if you like... I mean... that would be the presentation I would give you about this project. It might be appropriate to hear... from some of your...

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: That's... I'm going there...

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: This Executive Summary is to approve funding an RFP that will provide the need around a conceptual design based upon feedback and input from? Interested parties... concerned parties... all parties...

BARRY WILLIAMS: Well, there is several levels of this project being vetted. TDC, the Collier County Board of County Commissioners... ultimately if this RFP was approved. We would hire Q. Grady Minor and what they would do is begin the conceptual plans that were consistent with what the public would like and what the Foundation would like and ultimately to have approval by the Foundation.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: I just want some clarity on that. I don't like the idea of spending \$734,370 to an Engineer to go forward in developing a conceptual plan (inaudible) vacuum of input from all the interested parties. And that is what I would like some clarity on. If this is approved by all people who have the authority to approve it; and if Q. Grady Minor goes off in his office and based on what he heard from Pelican Bay Foundation, develops a conceptual plan, comes out of out of the box and everybody boos and hisses... that's not a good expenditure of funds. I don't... I am trying to understand that process.

HANK JONES: If I may comment?

BARRY WILLIAMS: Oh, please.

HANK JONES: What we would do in an RFP. We have stops built in, phases of the design effort. And the very first one is to come up with the input and the concepts. At that point... it is like a go, no go. That may send you back to the interested parties to proceed to more details. Just in case there is a problem.

BARRY WILLIAMS: The interesting thing about that to consider is... whether the southern boardwalk is a good idea or not as we go forward... there are some elements, like the kayak launch and the parking lot redo... which may be some good elements. So, if we are able to move forward with some of the elements that is better than just to kill the whole thing. I think.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: (Inaudible)

BARRY WILLIAMS: But your point too is a good one. Do you spend money now for a boardwalk nobody one wants? I don't know.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Well, we don't know that nobody wants it. Everyone isn't here... put it that way.

MURDO SMITH: I've got a question here. If the concepts is okay with Grady Minor, whoever... if there is not as many facilities would their fee be reduced?



BARRY WILLIAMS: I don't follow your question.

MURDO SMITH: say if they build a bathroom but not a boardwalk, or build a boardwalk and no bathroom... would there be a reduction?

BARRY WILLIAMS: They get paid by the services they provide so...

MURDO SMITH: And my next question Barry is... Is this a Tourist Development Beach Park Facility Funds or TDC Funds... is it Fund 183?

BARRY WILLIAMS: Fund 183 Beach Park Facility Funds

MURDO SMITH: Did this come through PARAB?

BARRY WILLIAMS: It did. It has been on the books for a long time. Funds have been appropriated since 2007. It's been a while.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Do I have any Public Comments on this? (Laughter) How many people want to speak on it? Well in that case we are going to have to limit you to 3 minutes.

MARSHA CRAVENS: I was requested... excuse me... Marsha Cravens with the Sierra Club. As you know all of this all came about today because I attended the October PARAB meeting and I brought it to your attention that there were RFPs going forward without any apparent meetings... without being brought before PARAB or any other Advisory Boards... that I could find and brought to your attention. I was requested to come back and do a presentation this month. So I have put together a PowerPoint, which I hope will work, it is basically, it is just some slides to help provide a little more background information on the real reason why this preliminary conceptual basis has given everybody so much heartburn.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Marsha, who are you speaking down on behalf of all these people?

MARSHA CRAVENS: I am speaking on the behalf of the Sierra Club and we have a Regional Group. But I am empowered to speak as one voice for the Sierra Club which we have many, many members in Florida. And we have Regional \_\_\_\_\_ and National members, which I am speaking on their behalf.

---

*She was unable to show slides in the beginning of her presentation due to technical difficulties.*

**Marsha Cravens** gave a slide presentation and the history on Pelican Bay/Clam Pass area. She spoke on natural resources, conservation and preservation areas. Some groups thought a lot of the projects proposed were not appropriate for this location.

She noted Mr. McAlpin stated the basis for the conceptual plans was to spread people out on the beach. People naturally spread out, they don't need a boardwalk.

---



VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Question Marsha, just so I understand... and this is all good input ... and all good background for us and very informative. The question at hand is... we have a proposed Executive Summary going forward... it's going to go forward on the 9<sup>th</sup>. Are you taking a position against... this...

MARSHA CRAVENS: Yes. The Sierra Club has been against...

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Wait... let me finish... please... are you're taking a position against the disbursement of any funds...

MARSHA CRAVENS: No.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: or Engineering and design from input from the public. Because... the reason I ask that... is because Hank said the RFP contains stops... where public input and reviews of step by step design is included. So, to get started with anything... you have to have some funds approved. If I am hearing him correctly... and I haven't seen the RFP... if I am hearing him correctly, there are stop points that solicits input from all concerned stockholders along the way. And you said you were against this Executive Summary, then you are against (inaudible)

MARSHA CRAVENS: No sir. What the Sierra Club objects to... is the conceptual basis because all of the construction projects, at least according to Mr. McAlpin, emanated from some arbitrary decision that all of the construction needed to be done to spread people out on the beach. And...

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: That's good enough. I've reread the first paragraph and it says under Objective, for a three phase engineering design project for the construction of additional boardwalk and restrooms at Clam Pass. Those are the fighting words from your perspective.

MARSHA CRAVENS: Right and the thing about this... these concerns, questions and objections have been raised anytime there has been any knowledge of... the Sierra, the Mangrove Action Group, The Conservancy, other user groups... and there has been some modifications. I think they took out the permanent shade structures... and they took out the observation deck and I think they modified the canoe and kayak launch but the major thing and the conceptual basis has continued to roll on.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: I'm not trying to words in your mouth. I'm going to shut up in a minute. I think you... I hear that you have made comments and the people have made input along the way, as they knew they had the opportunity to do so. And you feel there is a train going down the road

MARSHA CRAVENS: Yes sir.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: and those comments have been falling on deaf ears and they are going to continue to fall on deaf years unless...

MARSHA CRAVENS: Yes and the thing is... I came to one of the February meetings, one of those annual meetings that PARAB holds in February. It was the very meeting that Commissioner Fiala came and finally was getting some traction on Eagle Lakes Community Center. I remember because one of the items that was discussed and approved was the mobi mat kayak launch, which I thought this was wonderful. But at that meeting, I recommended that this



project planning go back to square one and not to proceed any further... I had the support, you know... members of this board expressed their support for that and we didn't hear anything for years... and I thought... I was shocked when it came up again.

CHAIR OLESKY: John, do you have something?

JOHN FUCHS: Just curious... the previous slide... from the facility... going down... how far is it?

GEORGE FOGG: Excuse me, I can give you the specifics on that... if you would. It is 550' from the beach access to the end of where the hotel has their umbrellas and tableside... I \_\_\_\_\_ it off on Sunday.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: We can only hear one person at a time. So please...

MICHAEL SERF: I was going to pass out shortly, grilling down more on Marsha's comments. It's about a 1000' give or take from the boardwalk, as you see there... down to the proposed washroom location.

MARY BILLS: Mr. Chair... Okay, as one of the newer Board members... why did Parks come up with the idea of... where would the additional restroom be? Down here at the far end of the beach or... or at the end of the boardwalk?

BARRY WILLIAMS: Let me show you... if you don't mind.

MARSHA CRAVEN: Go ahead. (She paused and continued to point out the existing facility plus... and the end of the property)

MARY BILLS: Okay... so your objection is to an additional restroom at that end and you want to see any expansion to the restroom done to the existing restroom area and you don't want to see a boardwalk going down that way... and... my questions to Parks is... what was our reasoning for the boardwalk and the restroom?

BARRY WILLIAMS: As Marsha mention, it was the concept of spreading people down the beach. The thought is... people don't venture to far from the bathrooms on the beach so if you gave them another spot, you can spread them out better.

UNIDENTIFIED PERSON: Barry, I have a question for you. Did this group create this plan or was this not a creation of Coastal Zone Management and then given to you guys?

BARRY WILLIAMS: It's a good question. I appreciate it. It actually originated from Parks, we gave it to Coastal Zone Management and they ran with it... and you know how that went. (Laughter) and so now, they have given it back. It actually started... there was a Workshop the Board did... I want to say 2004, where they were trying to come up with ideas to expand beach access. Our issues are... we just don't have enough access points and the County was getting larger. This was an idea that was born from it. There have been a variety of ideas that have since died. There was one, where we were going to take people from Bayview to a shuttle to Kewaydin. The City really knock that one out of the park. So these are ideas, these are just...

UNIDENTIFIED PERSON: There is another element... this is a why put... why are they going to put a tram down here?





MARSHA CRAVENS: And that is not really to scale. Because the way Mr. McAlpin described this additional boardwalk... is that it was going wide enough to be able to accommodate emergency vehicles and I don't think we got an exact width on it, but I was under the impression it was going to be 10-12' wide.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Gordon River Greenway... we just finished... that multi-use pathway is 12'

MARSHA CRAVENS: Yes, most of them are 12' now.

BARRY WILLIAMS: And I believe Clam Pass Boardwalk though is little larger to accommodate the tram but I don't know.

MARSHA CRAVENS: No, no, no

HANK JONES: 12' I just checked it.

UNIDENTIFIED PERSON: In any event... it was supposed to be no wider than the existing. No wider than the existing. No wider than the existing.

HANK JONES: The (inaudible) and the tram boardwalk is 12'.

BARRY WILLIAMS: I appreciate

MARSHA CRAVENS: And there is an area where it widens and narrows also. It is not a uniform width from the beginning to end.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Mr. Chair... you might want to take comments from the public.

MARSHA CRAVENS: Can Kathy participate here because Kathy and I do have some slides.

KATHY WORLEY: I was going to be quick... cause I know you guys are getting (inaudible)

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: I think we've got the whiff of \_\_\_\_\_. (Laughter)

KATHY WORLEY: In 2008 and 2009 I had some questions that never got answered. The newer presentation of what you all are seeing is a concept plan... was also delivered I believe... in 2013 to the Foundation.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Yes.

KATHY WORLEY: And I brought up some questions that never got answered so I am going to reiterate the questions and maybe somehow somebody has the answers. Also I apologize... I don't know exactly what the motion is. I am going to do this kinda... real quick. Starting with the kayak launch... there is a big clump of sea grass there and what I asked when you put in the kayak launch what is the shading that is going to occur from this and how close is it to the sea grass bed? Because as most of you probably know sea grass and shade... uh uh. That was one question. I still have that. The other question was with this parking lot... when you add... when you revamp it, was there any was any consideration to putting in permeable pavement and things, like that... so you don't have the water runoff with the oil and gas into these waterways. Another question is when you increase this width of this round-about thingy for the tram? How much of the vegetation is going to be actually impacted? And what types of vegetation will be impacted? And why do you need to widen it?



HANK JONES: They did widen it. It was done with Permeable pavers.

KATHY WORLEY: Okay. This has always been such a heartburn for me in particular... umm... at one point we were going through the mangroves and it got moved to going over some mangroves and water. And what people don't seem to think about when you built something like is, it is not just 12', unless you build from the bridge, which is more expensive. You are going to have to clear on either side more than 12'. So it is not just the footprint of impact of the boardwalk unless you go the expensive route and build from the bridge... and when you are creating a shade structure here that over area of waterways that has pretty good centric productivity in it... and that would go away. You can save a lot of important environmental areas, mangroves and also the centric through here.

MARY BILLS: So... that's not there now?

KATHY WORLEY: No. All of this is proposed. The other question we had is.... if you are going to build a boardwalk through here, you got a really high density of Gopher Tortoises in that area. Which is another threaten species. There are currently very few people that are accepting Gopher Tortoises because you have to relocate them. Most of the places that are accepting... we are not accepting anymore. We are at our capacity of caring in our area, we have scrubs. There is very little scrub areas in this County. So basically we have a lot of questions on this. I still haven't gotten any answers. I've thought about many answers and in order to take a position on this or anything I think ... it would behoove you to ask the questions so we get answers. Thank you.

MARSHA CRAVENS: I just want to point out I like the idea of the floating kayak launch. I like the idea of being handicap accessible, but that makes it to be a larger dock then if it weren't. There is a very large areas of oysters along the shoreline here. I've taken lots of photos of them. I think it's wonderful that we still have oyster population here because we have lost a lot of other areas of the system. I would hate to see us lose those oysters. I don't know how much of an impact a mobi mat would have, but I expect less than the dock. Basically, the Sierra Club is requesting and recommending... not that improvements... we're not requesting improvements not be done but we are requesting and recommending that the conceptual basis needs to be rethought, that it be consistent with the location of it being a natural resources protection area, and an undeveloped segment of a coastal barrier resource system... we don't have very many of those left... and it serves a lot of natural functions, a natural fishing habitat with all kind of water life... all kinds of fish... and all kinds of birds. It really is a special place.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Can I suggest... you have a list here. Maybe you want to go through the names.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: That was a good six minutes Marsha. (Laughter)

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Where are we at?

BARRY WILLIAMS: I think Michael, at the top. Mr. Seef...



MICHAEL SEEF: First of all, thank you for meeting with us. I truly appreciate it. Just to give a very brief point of what Marsha and Kathy had said. I will read you something that Margaret Bishop had as a result of the meeting with the Pelican Bay Foundation... The overall goal of the project is to maintain the natural features of the Park, minimize mangroves and native wildlife disturbance. Well... that's what you've been hearing. I would add to that ... coastal scrub hammock, which is another ecotone there and any wetlands. What I distributed to you, is two pages, basically. I think... I'm sorry I did not have an overhead for everybody... but this grills down on some of the questions about the distances... and this has to do with the spreading that Barry mentioned and Gary McAlpin before that. You can see... the 1000 feet between the boardwalk, just a little south of the boardwalk, because there are a lot of cabanas and beach stuff over there, down to the start of the washroom and the turn around. Give or take a few feet here and there... it's less than a quarter of a mile, let's put it that way... the total beach... to keep in mind is 6/10 of a mile...so this is roughly 2/10<sup>th</sup> of a mile... roughly a third... figure that. And then when I turn to the right 1,000 ft. that goes to Clam Pass. Now, the picture Marsha had on actually... did not show many people going out that way... but there are in fact... and that is only 1000 ft. and if you say 500' like we were talking about before... Why not spread North 500 ft.? So, I think the boardwalk you've been hearing... is problematic and makes a lot of noise. If you go to the next page. Any questions on this? If you go to the next page you will see the washrooms in more detail. It's about 10,000 sq. ft. and umm... and check me if I'm wrong... so Bluebill and Vanderbilt is about 10,000 sq. ft. ... roughly.

BARRY WILLIAMS: I don't know.

MICHAEL SEEF: Close to that...

BARRY WILLIAMS: I can tell you... this reflects a drawing that was done prior to our discussion with the Pelican Bay Foundation. What we have committed to them, was is to take a lot of this out. So this is not a fair depiction of what we are looking to do... but

MICHAEL SEEF: Okay... even if it's 8,000 sq. ft. Whatever. The problem is what you don't see on here, is was eluded to on one of the previous slides was the height of this thing. Because it is in a FEMA VE zone, it's in a flood zone, so you have to go a minimum 14' above the flood zone level. Before you start building... you have 14' and then you have another 20' above that. You're making a huge thing on what it amounts a very small beach. How many of you, have walked that beach... A few of you... when you walk down the beach and think of a 30 foot high structure and you think... 8,000 sq ft. -- 10,000 sq ft. You know... It's a monster in that place. We don't need that. Thank you.

GEORGE FOGG: I am going to speak as a landscape architect and a park planner. I've been planning parks for about... too long, 56 years now. I write books on the subject and the National Recreation Parks Association uses them. Basically, I have a different question than the environmental question... and that is... if you're going to... by the way... the park works fine right now. It doesn't need spreading... it doesn't need any adjustments... it doesn't need more toilets... it doesn't need any more concession, we're working fine. The parking lot is at capacity a few days out of the year. If



you're going to put all this stuff in here, all of it, there's a lot of it. If we are going to put it in, that means we have to have a lot more use. The only way we can get more use in here, is to increase the access, which means in fact... then building a parking structure. There is no other space for an additional parking lots, there is no other room for anyway to expand the use... the hotel this there and at capacity. The only reason... the only possible reason for any of this development, if everything is working good now. And I've been using it now for 25 years now. Every Sunday I go down and I also go down during the week sometimes. I have never yet seen a problem with it being too crowded or overused. So, the only conceivable reason for any of this... is to have more use. And if there is no more capacity for parking, unless we build a parking structure, then the project is dead. It is of absolutely no value.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: A race to nowhere.

GEORGE FOGG: In fact...it is exactly that. Thank you.

LINDA ROTH: I am a Pelican Bay resident. I think Marsha and Kathy have spoke pretty much of what I wanted to say. My most concern is the extra leg going over to the mangroves. One third of it is actually mangroves, they are very healthy mangroves. There is no need for that whole thing. In my opinion, there is no need have this extra leg and this drop off point for people and two shade shelters, I guess, shade structures. There is no problem.... we don't have to transport them on a tramway. They are using the section very well. Lately there are less people going from here to there. I understand that. This is absolutely no need for this... destroying the environment... and there is no need. People are using the stretch from here to there, so why are we constructing a tramway to transport them here.

SUSAN CALKINS: Susan Calkins... I live on the north end of the City of Naples. I'm not a Pelican Bay resident. I regularly go to Clam Pass, however, frequently see George there... my husband, is a guide at Clam Pass over there a lot. I would second the motion that number one it is rare that is over capacity... it works well. A lot of us residents and tourist, alike... like to be able walk a section of beach that isn't people to people to people, like we are in this room and to put in a tram and a boardwalk to simply carry even more people down there... I think it is a disservice to not just the residents but a lot of tourists, who come because it is a very natural place where they want to be. So, I think we need to consider that aspect of the use of the park, as well.

TOM CRAVENS: Well, I will just reiterate a few things... I agree with George and Susan both. To increase the density of usage on that park is doing a real disservice. The quality of the beach experience deteriorates as the number of user's increases. Secondly, if you go down to Clam Pass Park, during season, in the afternoon, on a nice day, you will find that there are cars circling the parking lot waiting to jump on to a free space when it comes available... what George says is correct. You can't exceed the usage beyond what the maximum usage is today, without creating a parking structure. It just won't work. That was a plan but they did away with it.

GAYLENE VASATURO: I am a Naples resident, I live in the Vineyards and I am a long time frequent user of Clam Pass. And I really appreciate (inaudible). I agree with those. I would like to submit written comments if that is acceptable.





BARRY WILLIAMS: Sure. We'll get you an email after the meeting.

GAYLENE VASATURO: I only ask... what does the public need... is the question I thought (inaudible). What Clam Pass offers, which is, a natural undeveloped stretch of beach. There is no other beach in Naples that offers that... it is unique... and once you start doing this you start degrading, at the very least, degrading what brings so many of us... residents and tourists alike to that area... my other comments I'll submit in writing.

JOHN DOMENIE: I'm John Domenie... Good afternoon. Sorry, I have been a year round resident in Pelican Bay for 27 years. I just completed serving 12 years on the Board for the Service Division. I hear a lot of negative comments about Pelican Bay Residents and the roll in creating the Clam Bay area. I won't go into how the 570 acres were formed and the Covenants. Here are some of the negatives I have heard:

Pelican Bay has been accused of building a bridge leading to Clam Pass Park limiting boating access to Seagate. No so. The County built the bridge. Nor has Pelican Bay objected to further development of the parking area, even a two story structure.

Pelican Bay has encouraged the use of all the 2 ½ miles of waterways within Clam Bay by kayakers and canoers by installing informative markers along the way. Access to the waterway is granted by the Foundation. And when you look at the map, you only see about a half mile out of the 2 ½ miles of waterways that are available to kayakers.

Pelican Bay has no objections to see better utilization of County property, if such a demand exists and as long as the nature is not encroached upon... I would ask has the need for greater need and usage been determined. On an average weekend, how many cars have been denied entry to the parking lot because it was filled and do such statistics exist?

Has the hotel has agreed to provide additional tram service to more distant locations along the beach? If not, will the County foot the bill for the additional tram service? If further development south were needed. Most beach goers head north toward Clam Pass to float in the pass or to go fishing on the ebb shoal. Have you considered developing northward, which was mentioned by somebody else, instead of to the south? In fact the dredging of beach quality sand from Clam Pass has generously contributed to enlarging Clam Pass Park by about two hundred feet over the last twenty years... and looking at a map, you can readily see the strip of land between the present turnaround of the beach and the City limits are very narrow and vulnerable to storm surge. Is it wise to invest County assets in that area?

And finally to save money and mangrove habitat have you considered reducing the length of the dog leg by bringing it in to the section closer to the present day turnaround?

And the original plan to the dog leg, going back to 2007, according to Mr. McAlpin, was in case of an emergency you can get the people off the beach quicker. The only thing is when you make a dog pass into a Y... and eventually you end up back to one path... in any case... so that argument fell by the wayside. The County has a great asset here and should be enjoyed by County residents, but please consider the impact on the \_\_\_\_\_. Thank you very much.



TED RAIA: I'm Ted Raia. I want to thank this Board for the time and efforts you put in caring for the parks... you do a remarkable job. There is no need for me to make comments on what people already have said. I support everything that has been said... and the only reason we are all here today is because of Gary McAlpin. (Laughter) (Inaudible)

I went down... Monday and spoke to the court reporters. Terri. Terri said he was very concerned about the sea grass because he lives in the sea grass and he is very concern about the dunes because that's where he goes... but he is willing to relocate. His girlfriend Theresa is living south... and he told Theresa... to put on your big girl pants and get ready to relocate. (Clapping and Laughter)

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Yeah, we have room in Immokalee for them. (Laughter) I know that because we have plenty over there ... (Laughter)

TED RAIA: The endangered species. Which the \_\_\_\_\_ is very concerned about the sea grass and the dunes because of beach re-nourishment... and now you speak of the mangroves, only black mangroves speak because they have papa bulyas and the other ones (inaudible). They said one thing... if you will... you're going to have to build this path all the way down the boardwalk... not a bad idea for mangroves... why not put the Y in... test it out first and see whether the traffic really needs it... because to put a Y in and destroy all my sisters and brothers, the mangroves, is a waste. So that is my comment on the mangroves and the (Inaudible) (Clapping and Laughter)

MURDO SMITH: We can't accept this... it is here say.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: That's true... we can't accept this...that's here say. (Laughter)

MARY BOLEN: I'm Mary Bolen. I agree with all that has been said. I have been a Clam Pass Guide for the Conservancy and I am a Pelican Bay resident. I continue to do walks on the Pelican Bay side. I volunteer for (inaudible) so this area here... is so special. When people come in to visit us, and they come from the east coast and say... aw... wonderful, we don't have anything like this, all we do have is structures... and it is something really special. If you haven't been there... please go. And we have guided tours by the Conservancy, in the morning at 9 o'clock, I believe it is. Come and enjoy the walk and find what you're missing. Thank you.

DICKSON BROWN: I agree with everybody that has been said. First of all, I disagree with Marsha. I think spending a penny on this, is a waste of County money. It think you can do much better with your \$700,000. I walk down there regularly. I have never seen the beach overcrowded. The point about parking, it's obvious... I don't think the people of Seagate would never let you build a parking structure there. It is a waste of money just because it was budgeted on some secret arrangement in 2007 doesn't mean you have to spend the money. Spend the money someplace where it can be productive. I really think it is a major mistake. 10-15 Years ago, our black mangroves started to die because of thoughtless action, it was rescued because people figured out how to deal with it. I am really afraid this will be another example of thoughtless action and we will have to rescue again.

BONNIE MICHAELS: I live in North Naples and I agree with everyone. I walk it regularly. I think the one feeling I feel today is... sort of



an anger... that we've been saying this for how many years. We put this whole project aside because nobody wanted it. We thought it was dead. What has changed? Everything everyone says, still exists. Now I know the County is big on let's get the tourist in... let's keep the tourist. Well... some of us also live here full time. We want the tourists to have a good time. They can still have a good time. There is lots of beaches here. I think it is everything... incase we're going to get another tourist person in... you know... beach access... beach access. It works the way it is. I think those of us that walk it every day can see trams going back and forth and back and forth that the people and the safety issue... I mean... now the season has started. I walk there and the trams are coming back and forth... and you add more trams and more legs... it will be just like a circus and not the walk you would like. And thanks so much for listening.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Wasn't it in this area... they were going to put a fishing pier out there. (Laughter)

BARRY WILLIAMS: Ahaaaaa... (Laughter)

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Didn't you want a pier out there? (More laughter) Is that what you wanted out there...

BARRY WILLIAMS: That was McAlpin's idea., it wasn't mine.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Just for clarification. I think since this was on our agenda, the Executive Summary was presented even though we can't decide anything, we have heard from a lot the residents, I think what we have the authority to do... is to make a motion either in support of this Executive Summary as it is written or... or not and maybe with some prerequisites. So Mr. Chair I would like to take a stab at something here... and see where it goes.

***Vice Chair Brougham moved that Parks and Recreation Board do not approve the Executive Summary and with a recommendation that before anything goes forward, that there be prerequisite public information meetings, similar to what is conducted with PUD submittals so the Board of County Commissioners have the benefit of the input from all concern parties prior to spending any money. Second by Ms. Bills.***

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Do we have any questions?

REBECCA GIBSON-LAMEL: I do... who wants this? Is there another side? I mean ... or is it just...

BARRY WILLIAMS: The Board of County Commissioners have appropriated funding and did a Workshop in 2004 and approved this as a concept. The Board of County Commissioners have changed dramatically since 2004. But it's being driven by the Board of County Commissioners. This isn't Staff's idea. This is appropriated funds and a project for us to try to make happen. So this is part of the process of doing that.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: So staff is basically following direction from the Board to advance this. I am not privy to all prior meetings of the Board and direction but I would presume they haven't been informed of all the most recent inputs and comments and so forth. I just think it needs to be refreshed



BARRY WILLIAMS: It's chicken or egg. It's like this would come before them very soon and these same comments would be heard by them... I'm thinking.... you're all going to show up... right?

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: And I'm thinking that to. And my motion is that Parks and Recreation comments be included in or in conjunction with this Executive Summary that goes forward.

BARRY WILLIAMS: The only thing I can say... We are at this point right now because of the outreach we've done with the Pelican Bay Foundation, The Mangrove Action Group, the Pelican Bay Services Division... we know there is opposition... we know there are some thoughts about how we can change this to make this a viable project. And so... we're just trying to get to that point.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: I understand that. What I hear is... and I recall going back the infamous bathroom... how much money did we spend, multiple times going back before the Board the Board of County Commissioners, who reacted to public input and ultimately changed that. We spent money, after money, after money in engineering services to redesign that damn bathroom... and I can kind of see the same thing developing here... I said it...

MURDO SMITH: I don't know if this is worth anything or not. I just thought maybe I would throw it out there... because I thought it was a pretty good idea for the Big Corkscrew Regional Island Park. They have a website where people can put comments on the project or on Corkscrew. Would this be feasible thing for people to do?

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Let's vote on this first and then we can get into that.

BARRY WILLIAMS: Typically, before... we... at Big Corkscrew we spent money for a Consultant help with our planning and our public meetings. For us to get started, we have to hire somebody to answers some of the technical questions that are out there. If there is a desire not to build this... we'll know in this meeting, the TDC meeting and the Board of County Commissioners. They say this project is done... were done and we go on to something else. If they say yes... then we will hire a Consultant to explore these questions that emerge. I don't have the answer some of the technical questions. Some of it obviously the Board decided years ago that there was a need to try expand access here. I don't know what to say other than that.

MURDO SMITH: Also, you said there are some options that were feasible... still.

BARRY WILLIAMS: We've had some conversations with the Pelican Bay Foundation. They are ultimately, the folks that have to approve us doing anything in this area. And I don't want to say that and say... that we don't listen to the public, obviously that is just as important. But they are the ones if they don't us give permission, we don't do anything. There have been conversations about the Y taking a leg out... do we need it... I think that is a valid thought... Part of the conversations with Pelican Bay Foundation have been on the size of the facility, we're not looking to replicate Vanderbilt concession stand... believe me.... we know how that worked. The shade structures are gone.





We are just trying to provide basic amenities to the public in the beach locations that we manage. That is all we are looking to do.

MURDO SMITH: It doesn't show different up there... up on the screen

BARRY WILLIAMS: Well... a lot of the photos... and I think maybe part of where Phil is going is. I don't know... we've communicated or attempted to communicate somewhat... there has been a lot of communication about this project over the years. Old plans have been shown and old feelings, in terms of with Staff involved and whatnot. I don't think it's a bad idea if we continue dialogue, we would certainly accept that recommendation... if that is direction you guys are going.

CHAIR OLESKY: Call for the question? All in favor signify by saying aye.

CHAIRMAN OLESKY: Oppose, likewise.

***Motion carried; 6 – 0.***

BARRY WILLIAMS: Just for clarification... tell me what you recommended.

VICE CHAIR BROUGHAM: Recommend denial or non-approval on the Executive Summary as drafted with a recommendation that a public information meeting with all interested stakeholders be held before we approve any significant funds are spent.

---

### **Naples Grande Easement**

Sue Zimmerman reported on research done on the Naples Grande easement. She identified the area as: a strip of land at the end of Creighton Road where it intersects Seagate on the north side.

- The easement is owned by the County as a public ROW since 1985.
- This area has never been paved, always been maintained as a grassy area.
- PAR could generate a project to build a pathway to connect Creighton and Seagate.
- A ROW permit would be required.
- Pulled a GIS Report and there is a water main there.
- NPO would only be involved if Federal Funding was involved.

It was suggested contact be made with the Naples Pathway Coalition and the Pelican Bay Foundation/Services Division for a possible partnership and to place on the "To Do List".

### **Parking Fees**

Staff provided a copy of the Fee Schedule to answer a question regarding fees associated with special events. (See attached)

Barry Williams indicated this was addressed on Page 8 under Special Events - Ski Party. All questions were addressed.



**VIII. Adopt a Park Reports**

**Vice Chair Brougham** will do this report at the next meeting.

**Ms. Bills** reported visiting East Naples Community Park and received 3 requests:

- Number signs on courts. They are currently using paper ones that get wet.
- Shade for the bleachers. During the summer, it gets real steamy.
- A pathway for wheel chairs, for them to go from one end to the other.

**IX. Directors Highlights**

**Barry Williams** reported the Gordon River Greenway is opened.

The southern entrance is closed and will be opened in January.

**Jeanine McPherson-Hogle** verified the Adopt a Park assignments with the Advisory Board. This item will be put on the December Agenda for further discussion.

Staff will offer some suggestions.

**Vice Chair Brougham** asked for an update on the electrical issues at Fitness Center in Immokalee.

**Jeanine McPherson-Hogle** responded the vendor went out to repair and it wasn't what they expected. The vendor previously submitted a quote but it has not been repaired. Facilities Management is involved. Staff will give an update at the December meeting.

**X. Informational Items – Read only**

**XI. Public Comments/Board Member Comments**

**NEXT MEETING: Regular Meeting: December 17, 2014**

**Location: North Collier Regional Park, Administration Building, Conference Room A, 15000 Livingston Road is scheduled for 2:00 P.M.**

**There being no further business for the good of the County, the meeting was adjourned by order of the Chairman at 5:00 P.M.**

**COLLIER COUNTY PARKS & RECREATION  
ADVISORY BOARD**



**Chairman Ski Olesky, Chairman**

These Minutes were approved by the Committee/Board on 12/17/14, as presented ☒ or as amended \_\_\_\_.

